"You Can Find Anything You Want": A Critical Reflection on Research on Trafficking in Persons within and into Europe

Liz Kelly*

INTRODUCTION

The title of this paper – a direct quote from an economically successful Turkish male prostitute user (Erder and Kaska, 2003: 65) – encapsulates attitudes underpinning the treatment of human beings as commodities. Yet, at the same time, we cannot "find anything we want" in the research on trafficking, which continues to be deficient in a number of respects. This paper takes a critical look at the current state of research with respect to Europe; given that trafficking occurs into and out of Europe to other regions of the globe, and that new concepts and theoretical perspectives transcend locality, "Europe" has been interpreted broadly. It both stands alone and acts as a companion piece to *Journeys of Jeopardy* (Kelly, 2002), extending that overview not only in terms of recent publications and more complex frameworks, but also through an attempt to move beyond the focus on trafficking for sexual exploitation to include that for domestic service and labour exploitation.[1] The majority of published material still focuses on sexual exploitation and few investigations include more than one form (for exceptions, see Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2003; Kelly, 2005). Emphasis here has also been placed on conceptual framings and frameworks that could enhance future work.

The scale of publications on trafficking in persons has grown hugely in the last decade, reflecting and constructing a context in which funding for counter-trafficking efforts has also increased substantially. As the issue gained policy recognition and financial resources were mobilized, many more players entered

* Child and Woman Abuse Studies Unit, University of North London, United Kingdom.

Published by Blackwell Publishing Ltd.,
9600 Garsington Road, Oxford OX4 2DQ, UK,
and 350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148, USA.

© 2005 IOM

International Migration Vol. 43 (1/2) 2005
ISSN 0020-7985

the increasingly competitive field of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and international non-governmental organizations (INGOs) activity. While the engagement in research and documentation of international bodies, including at least five United Nations (UN) agencies, is welcome, it does not necessarily ensure a deepening of the knowledge base. Publications may primarily reflect a claims-making process, vying for influence over how the issue is understood and where it is located intellectually, symbolically, and materially. This paper argues for a widened framing and a more interdisciplinary approach to the issue of trafficking in order not only to enhance intellectual understanding but also to provide firmer ground on which to build and assess counter-trafficking strategies.

No claim is made to have undertaken a comprehensive review of all recently published European research. Although a large number of Internet and academic database searches were undertaken, only material published in English has been included. With that said, a substantial amount of material was critically analysed, with much of it falling into the patterns noted in *Journeys of Jeopardy* (Kelly, 2002): single country studies (see, e.g. Erder and Kaska, 2003; Hughes and Denisova, 2001; Human Rights Watch, 2002) or regional overviews (see, e.g. Apap, 2003; Chammartin, 2003; Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003; Zimmerman et al., 2003) documenting and reflecting upon existing efforts and interventions. The sections that follow address: continued methodological deficiencies, including the perennial question of defining trafficking; the current knowledge base with respect to trafficking for sexual exploitation, domestic service, labour exploitation, and trafficking of children; the construction of hierarchies of worth; and new approaches to the study of traffickers and exploiters; it concludes with an argument for a recasting of the future research agenda.

WEAKNESSES AND LIMITATIONS IN DATA AND METHOD

A considerable proportion of trafficking research is funded/commissioned/conducted by international organizations as one element of counter-trafficking programmes. Establishing an evidence base for interventions is to be commended, but most such commissions have short time lines and require policy relevant findings and conclusions. Pure research studies and detailed research evaluations continue to be extremely rare, and a limited number of established social scientists are involved in exploring the contours of human trafficking. These patterns contribute to several methodological weaknesses in the field.

The majority of published studies continue to say little, if anything, about the methods used to collect and analyse the data they present, restricting this part to a page or a short appendix (see Kelly, 2002). In some cases it is evident that the authors have limited research training, illustrated by a number of omis-

sions including a lack of critical assessment of official statistics, a failure to draw on qualitative material in anything other than an illustrative way, and no discussion of the limitations of method and data. There is also confusion with respect to methodology, methods, tools, and analysis, resulting in minimal documentation of how research was undertaken. For example, there is never any discussion of how interviews are conducted with women who speak a range of languages, or how translation affects the depth and quality of data. Few multi-country/regional studies present data in a comparative way that identifies similarities and differences, opting for the basic route of taking each nation as a separate case.

Other methodological challenges are inherent to the topic, as the illegality of trafficking in persons ensures that accurate measures of extent will elude researchers, however much policy makers and politicians may seek them (Kangaspunta, 2003). What can be presented, however, are "best estimates", the accuracy of which depends on the sources relied on and assumptions made. Unfortunately, few estimates of scale include the background information and thinking underpinning the calculation, denying readers the opportunity to assess the claim.

The lack of methodological transparency provides little foundation for assessing the depth and quality of research and denies the entire field opportunities for learning and knowledge transfer. A 2003 UN Children's Fund (UNICEF)/UN Inter-Agency Project on Human Trafficking in the Greater Mekong Subregion (UNIAP) project in Thailand, for example, used participatory research methods to develop research capacity in villages that simultaneously act as a way to trace women and girls who have been trafficked. The interim report contains hints that implementation has been problematic, but the absence of detail means that neither methodological nor practical lessons can be learned.

The recurring problem of definition

The question of definition continues to vex researchers and practitioners in this field. While the definition in the UN protocol has provided a baseline,[2] specifying that cases of trafficking involve the three elements of recruitment, movement/receipt, and intention to exploit, this has not resolved the debates (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2003) which coalesce around unresolved positions on the issues of migration, prostitution, and agency. This preoccupation has deflected attention from a range of other questions about which it might be possible to generate new and revealing knowledge, such as why so little attention has been paid to trafficking which does not involve children and/or sexual exploitation, and how a wider framing might change what we think we know about the prevalence and patterns involved. At the micro level there has been hardly any

empirical investigation of how members of civil society and those whose labour and trust has been exploited define trafficking, yet this has direct effects on whether people seek advice or help, and will determine how they respond to questions intended to discern if they have been trafficked or "merely" smuggled. How service providers and state agents define trafficking, and especially the extent to which they introduce additional requirements which do not appear in the protocol in order to construct a category of "deserving" victims or ration scarce resources, is seldom studied in any depth, although published material does document these practices (Kelly, 2002).

While the UN protocols on trafficking and smuggling attempt to make clear, and to an extent absolute, the distinctions between the two practices, a number of studies are highlighting that this is a fiction (see Kelly, 2002). From the perspective of victims trafficking is a process within which, in most instances, they believe they are making an agreement to be smuggled; the exploitation aspect may only be evident at an end point, where someone demands payment they think they are owed or discovers that promised remittances have not been sent to their family (Kelly, 2005). What we know about both smuggling[3] and trafficking suggests that it would be more accurate to view them as a continuum, shading into and out of one another across a number of dimensions (ILO, 2003b; IOM, 2004; Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2003). There are both overlaps and transitions from smuggling to trafficking, made more likely where the journey is lengthier since this increases the opportunities for exploitation and the size of debt on arrival. Many who are smuggled rely on third parties for employment in the destination country, which increases the potential layers of control that can be used to create conditions of bondage (Shelley, 2001). A diagrammatic representation of some of the overlaps is presented in a recent study of Afghanistan (IOM, 2004), and could certainly be extended.

This study also introduces the concept of "trafficking-like practices". A number of these – child/early/forced marriage, kidnapping, bride price, and exchanging women as a way of settling tribal disputes – are already specified as "harmful traditional practices" within UN definitions of gender-based violence. Where local custom, sometimes supported by law, treats women so explicitly as property, their commodification through trafficking is facilitated. Other less gender-specific aspects involve kidnapping and holding young migrants ransom while exploiting their labour and/or sexuality (IOM, 2004), practices that have also been documented in Central Asia (Kelly, 2005).

THE CURRENT KNOWLEDGE BASE

The difficulties of establishing accurate baseline estimates for any form of trafficking, at global, regional, or national levels, have been well documented, as

has the need for more careful explication of how figures are determined (Kangaspunta, 2003; Kelly, 2002; Laczko, 2002). Assessing what data we do have is made more complex by the fact that governments, the media, and even researchers continue to conflate migration, asylum, refugees, trafficking, and smuggling. Indeed it may prove impossible to resolve this conceptual confusion, since in some instances it serves political and ideological ends (Laczko, 2002), and in others represents a sincere attempt to reflect the complexities of lived experiences.

In 2003 the UN Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) undertook the useful exercise of compiling and comparing the worldwide estimates for trafficking, and while the actual presentation of the data (found at: www.unescobkk.org/culture/trafficking, Factsheet 1) leaves much to be desired, it nonetheless reveals a range of figures that differ by factors of between two to five. The highest estimate of 4 million trafficked persons per year globally has been used by International Organization for Migration (IOM), United States Agency for International Development (USAID), and the UN. However, graphically documenting this variation is simply a first step. It is difficult to move on to postulating why estimates differ so markedly since contextual information, such as whether the figures cover all forms of trafficking in persons or only sexual exploitation, is lacking. The global estimates in successive US Department of State Trafficking in Persons reports (US Department of State, 2002, 2003, 2004) have declined year on year, as shown below:[4]

2002	700,000-4 million
2003	800,000-900,000
2004	600,000-800,000

These adjustments can be related to both the widespread critique of the absence of documentation accompanying such figures and the development of more "evidence-based" approaches to estimation. The lack of detail about the shifts[5] and why estimates continue to fall is regrettable because it precludes academic exploration and permits continued speculation about "advocacy numbers".[6] Adding to the lack of clarity is the fact that while the overall framing of the report is trafficking in persons, most of the content and data are confined to sexual exploitation. Including other forms of trafficking would increase estimates considerably, and if documented by region and form of trafficking, probably heighten awareness of intra-regional flows.

Even establishing seemingly simple facts, such as how many victims have been assisted in a region, produces complex methodological challenges, including how to avoid double counting individuals. An attempt to establish a sound methodology addressing this question in south-east Europe (Hunzinger and Coffey,

2003) for the previous year encountered a number of complex problems with respect to record keeping. Some have argued that the small numbers of identified victims, in this instance 5,203, demonstrate that estimates of scale, such as those cited above, are wildly inaccurate (Chapkis, 2003). The report, however, makes clear that apart from under-detection and under-reporting, in resource poor contexts a filtering process determines who receives assistance.

Flows and/or "hot spots"

Global trafficking flows echo patterns of the globalization of labour migration, albeit in contexts where increasingly strong immigration controls create irregular migration and through this the markets for facilitation and smuggling. At the same time, however, movements are not simply between the global north and south, with greater but less documented flows taking place within regions (Kelly, 2002; Kelly, 2005).

The strongest flows now are taking place *within* Europe – a shift from the picture in previous decades, where trafficked women came primarily from Asia and South America. This illustrates the dynamism of trafficking, with rapid shifts in countries of origin and routes reflecting the ability of traffickers to respond quickly to changing political and economic conditions and counter-trafficking responses (Shelley, 2002b). At the same time, there are still large flows into Europe from other continents, including Africa (Pearson, 2003). One recent aspect of the changing context has been the accession of ten states into the European Union, a number of which had been identified as source, but primarily transit, countries in the 1990s (Kelly, 2002). The adjustments in border regimes required for accession have led to a decline in trafficking from or through Hungary and Slovenia, accompanied by increased recruitment in, and transit through, Romania and Serbia (Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003).

The documentation of routes and flows is a migration framing, drawn from classical demography. Asking similar questions but using the criminological framing of crime mapping and "hot spots" might produce additional insights. Explaining what it is about a particular location at a particular moment in time that makes it favourable has been a route criminologists have used to discover both intervention points once the pattern has developed, and opportunities for prevention and early intervention. Examining the emergence of Turkey as a "hot spot" would involve discussion of its strategic location, large landmass, increasing economic activity, and open visa regime to facilitate tourism. A less obvious aspect affecting Turkey currently involves "ocular" or "shuttle" migrants – small-scale female traders/entrepreneurs from many countries in Eastern Europe and Central Asia who regularly travel to Greece, Turkey, and the Gulf states to purchase goods for re-sale at home. There are complex, and as yet poorly

understood and documented, connections between these patterns and trafficking in persons (Kelly, 2005).

Increasing reference to significant flows to the Gulf states of migrant labour and trafficking for domestic service, the sex industry, and other forms of bonded labour is evident. There are an estimated 20,000 to 25,000 Ethiopian domestic workers in Lebanon alone (Pearson, 2003), many of whom are illegal because there are only three state-registered employment agencies in Ethiopia. Increased case-based documentation of trafficking is evident, but limited research/documentation has been undertaken, with what little has been published focusing on the legal context (see, for example, Mattar, 2001) or the use of children as camel jockeys (Mattar, 2003a). Two recent exceptions include a discussion of the range of trafficking (Mattar, 2003a) and a short journalistic piece by Donna Hughes (2004) on the extent of organized prostitution in Iran. Fifty prosecutions – many large scale – took place between 2000 and 2003, revealing extensive internal trafficking and trafficking of Iranian girls and women into the EU (France, UK), the other Gulf states, Pakistan, and Afghanistan.

Accounting for why the Gulf constitutes a "hot spot" with respect to all forms of trafficking deserves more attention, including the complexities and tensions with respect to Islam and the purchase of sexual services. Prostitution was legal in many Arab countries during the first part of the twentieth century (Mattar, 2001), while more recently most systems of Islamic law have defined it as a form of adultery, for which both parties are criminally liable. The possibility that women could also be prosecuted acts as a powerful disincentive for any Muslim woman to report/give evidence against traffickers. Shi'a Muslims, however, have in some instances invoked the notion of temporary marriage as a legitimizing Islamic framework for prostitution, especially the model where one man takes ownership of women for a period of weeks or months. Ethiopian trafficked women, for example, are divided upon arrival to the United Arab Emirates (UAE), with the most "attractive" reserved for individual contracts.[7]

In temporary marriages, the marriage itself may be entered into orally, without witnesses or registration. Moreover women in temporary marriage have no right to divorce; nor are they entitled to inheritance. Meanwhile men may terminate the agreement at any time. It has been argued that temporary marriages make women vulnerable to sexual exploitation and are very often used as a legitimate means to force women into prostitution (Mattar, 2003: 726).

Officials from the Iranian Ministry of the Interior have proposed legalizing brothels which were to be called "morality houses", using the temporary marriage custom, as a way to deal with burgeoning prostitution in Iran (Hughes, 2004: 2).

Trafficking for sexual exploitation also occurs in Lebanon, which has a less restrictive social policy, including a state-controlled brothel regime.[8]

The large movements into Israel also deserve attention, given that during conflict the movement tends to be outward. Of the 400 women detected in 2000 (Levekron, 2001) the vast majority came from Ukraine, Russia, and Moldova, and although 70 per cent knew they would be working in prostitution, they had not previously been active in the sex industry. One of the situational factors at work in Israel is the presence of a significant Russian diaspora, of which a minority of the members are organized crime bosses. Routes into Israel have become more complex as efforts to limit trafficking have increased: one involves arriving in Egypt as a tourist from Moscow and then being taken across the desert for days by Bedouins. Recent accounts of women travelling this route document rape and being held in the desert for several months (Kelly, 2005).

New trends in trafficking for sexual exploitation

Journeys of Jeopardy (Kelly, 2002) outlined the major flows of trafficking for sexual exploitation within and out of Europe at the turn of the twentieth century, noting the increased relevance of intra-regional flows, and posing the question of whether trafficking routes and "hot spots" extend sex markets, which in turn increase the demand for trafficked women. A number of recent reports support this analysis, especially with respect to the Balkans (SEERIGHTS, 2003; O'Brien et al., 2004). An Amnesty International press statement in May 2004 asserted that the sex industry in Kosovo had not only grown ten times since the early 1990s, but also that the majority of women within it were trafficked. The emergence of extensive sex markets in the poorest countries in Europe has taken place in the nexus between the poverty of transition, conflict, gender inequality, and human trafficking routes.

Sex industries in the West continue to expand, while being less able to recruit nationals to work within them, thus creating a strong market for both migrants and trafficked women. Sex markets are increasingly diverse and wide ranging, with a small top end where the financial rewards can be substantial, and a large middle and bottom end, where conditions vary, and in some instances can only be described as sexual slavery (Bindel and Kelly, 2003). Turkish research confirms and illustrates these processes:

> …this was a very diversified field where highly organized international syndicates, relatively small networks working through intermediaries and local pimps, as well as independent sex workers all interacted, characterized by illegality and various degrees of deception, mistreatment and exploitation (Erder and Kaska, 2003: 61).

This study is unusual in the breadth of data drawn on, including interviews with two customers who admit to knowing that women are exploited, controlled, and lack freedom. One customer even revealed that he was considering purchasing a trafficked woman for his personal use, reflecting patterns noted in the Gulf (see earlier) and in Bosnia (Kelly, 2002). The extent of this practice in Europe is unclear, as is the recent documentation of pimps/traffickers "renting" women to men, who then pimp the women themselves.[9]

The first documentation of those assisted in the UK shelter (Poppy Project, 2004) is to be commended for its transparency and detail. Data collection is explained as a process, with initial entries subsequently updated as more detail emerges and as women trust the project enough to reveal aspects of the truth which they fear may discredit them. The data also confirm that narrow definitions act as a filter into support, with strict rules by the Home Office (alongside personal choice) meaning that less than half of those referred in the first year (n=114) receive assistance (n=46) and less than one-quarter receive shelter (n=26). Three-quarters come from Europe, both accession and CIS states. The systematic collection of data on gender violence before and during trafficking is also welcome and shows that before they were trafficked, more than one-third (38%) report being subjected to multiple forms; almost half (46%) were sexually abused/raped; one-third (31%) were sexually abused as children; two-thirds (62%) experienced physical assault; and almost half (46%) experienced domestic violence, primarily as children living with it. A range of traumatic symptoms have also been documented, with almost all (92%) reporting mental distress, including:

> …near universal problems with sleeping/nightmares, anxiety and fear and common problems with loss of appetite and controlling aggression. Many women also talked about experiencing panic attacks, memory problems, self blame… flashbacks… thoughts of suicide, self-harm and crying constantly. One woman articulately sums this up as feeling like she is "screaming inside all the time" (Poppy Project, 2004: 7).

These data echo the experiences of shelters in countries of origin working with women who have been returned. The SEE overview of assistance concluded that 95 per cent of their service users needed treatment for sexually transmitted infections (STIs) and many needed intensive psychological support, but the most extensive counselling currently on offer was limited to three to four weeks (Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003: 22). The inadequacy of such provision is confirmed by an overview (Rousseaux, 2003) of the psychological impacts, with links to the most recent work on trauma and clinical practice regarding torture, child sexual abuse, and domestic violence. The disconnection from others, a feature of trauma, is accentuated in contexts where victimization carries shame for victims, and has serious implications for reintegration in contexts where not

only is there minimal support, but it is also taboo to discuss mental distress and/or and the realities of sexual exploitation (Bales, 2003).[10] The Afghanistan study (IOM, 2004) presents an important challenge for counter-trafficking work, which must refocus shame so that it both attaches to perpetrators and ceases to be a deterrent to seeking support.[11] That it arises so strongly in this report is partly the outcome of the level of shame in an honour culture functioning as a huge deterrent to women reporting trafficking and any form of sexual violence, although shame attaches to victims of all forms of sexual violence across various cultures and contexts.

A note on domestic service

This section does not seek to review the burgeoning connections between migration and domestic service (see Anderson, 2000 for an overview) but points to what indicators currently exist regarding the links between trafficking and systems of inequality. Reflecting patterns highlighted earlier, there are movements between continents alongside intra-regional flows. Crossovers with child trafficking are also strong, connected to long-standing indigenous patterns of child servants and internal trafficking. The majority of those involved are female, reflecting the virtual global allocation of household and personal care work to women. The largest and most sustained international flows appear to be into Arab countries (Mattar, 2003) and within Asia (from Indonesia to Malaysia, for example). Movements into Europe are also strong, but there is limited documentation about the relative numbers with legal permits, and those who are irregular and/or trafficked. The increased use of migrant labour for private care of the disabled and elderly in developed countries is also extending the market (Ehrenriech and Hochschild, 2003).

The privatized nature of domestic work provides fertile ground for exploitation, and trafficking is one variant in a wider system of ill-treatment by recruitment agencies and individual employers. Recruitment agencies are known for charging excessive fees (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2003a: 14) and failing to fulfil contracts which state they will find another employer if serious problems are encountered. Many domestic workers work in a form of debt bondage, that is, they work for nothing to pay off transportation and arrangement fees. This parallels the practices of brothel owners (Kelly, 2002) who evade their financial responsibilities by finding reasons to fire workers when they are due to be paid their wages and the return fare home (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2003a: 15; Chammartin, 2003). Another parallel is the scale of exploitation inflicted on all domestic workers, legal and illegal, ranging from excessive work hours to control of movement (often including removal of papers) and sexual abuse by male members of the household (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2003b).

A major problem with domestic work is that it is rarely recognized as a form of labour. In most of the Gulf states, for example, such a law would be regarded as an intrusion into the privacy of the family, and domestic workers are defined as members of the household (Matter, 2003b). Discussions about bringing domestic workers within labour law frequently flounder in developing countries, as recently happened in Ethiopia, with difficulties centring on how to define it, and draw boundaries between this and systems of family fosterage. Such arguments, however, do not hold for Western destination countries where inclusion is also resisted (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2003b). There is a clear need for more detailed exploration of trafficking for domestic work in Europe, and for deeper connections to be made across the trafficking and labour exploitation literatures.

A note on labour exploitation

Trafficking for labour exploitation is used to refer to workers who are in less privatized sectors of economies, including agriculture, construction, and manufacturing (including low-tech/craft production). In much of the literature, reference is made to the preponderance of men in this form of trafficking, although recent data (Kelly, 2005) and the feminization of migration more broadly, point to the presence of large numbers of women, especially in the intra-regional movements.

Underpinning trafficking for labour exploitation in Europe is the demand for cheap and malleable labour for businesses which are no longer competitive and can be relocated (agriculture, garments) and those that cannot (construction, catering) (ILO, 2003b). Significant sectors of western European industry are now dependent on migrant labour, both legal and illegal, especially agriculture in the UK, France, Spain, Switzerland, and the Netherlands. There are also large numbers involved in the garment and shoe industries in Italy and France, where both national pride and premium prices accompany labels that state "made in Italy" or "produced in France".

In other parts of the world historic and contemporary practices of slavery, bonded labour, child labour, and labour camps have much in common with, and could be understood as precursors of, trafficking. One example here is the construction industry, which is now dominated by a small number of major companies that subcontract to a globalized workforce. Depending on where the contracts are located the workforce will experience various forms of restriction and exploitation. Currently, many projects in Russia use bonded/trafficked male workers, with those from Central Asia the most likely to be trafficked and earning the lowest wages. They are also often required to live in walled-off sites, within a version of the gangmaster system (Kelly, 2005; ILO, 2003a).

The "gangmaster" system has been subjected to increased scrutiny in the United Kingdom, partly in response to revelations after the death of a group of Chinese cockle pickers in 2004, although research had already documented its revival and expansion (ILO, 2003b). Based on a nineteenth-century tradition (ILO, 2003b: 13), there are documented connections with organized crime. Workers, who are a combination of legal and illegal migrants, have to pay 150 euros for a gangmaster's telephone number and a fee of about 400 euros to arrange work and accommodation. Work is seldom guaranteed, and wage rates are significantly less than the national minimum wage. Low wages, and the extortionate charges for transport and accommodation, make it difficult to get out of debt. In a case study based on agricultural work in the Midlands (ILO, 2003b) not all of the undocumented workers had been trafficked, but all were subjected to labour exploitation by virtue of their vulnerable position, and were undoubtedly trapped in a form of bonded labour (ILO, 2003b: 25).

The extent to which the definition of trafficking applies to labour exploitation of migrant workers has not received the same level of attention as the application to sexual exploitation. Some of the dilemmas and anomalies concern whether an unbroken chain needs to exist between recruitment and eventual exploitation, as there appears to be more fragmentation in this area, with some agencies facilitating smuggling and promising jobs in the destination, but abandoning people there with no resources or papers (Kelly, 2005). This "position of vulnerability" is exploited by unscrupulous employers who appear aware of these deceptive practices to the extent that they frequent the locations where migrants are dropped. One difference with respect to sexual exploitation appears to be that fees are more likely to be paid/required before departure and are often borrowed from family members. It is the responsibility for this debt which acts as a barrier to seeking help or reporting exploitation.

A note on child trafficking

The knowledge base on children is even less strong than that on adults, with the most significant movements taking place outside Europe. While children's charities in many European countries continue to publish studies of child trafficking and document cases of minors being trafficked into the sex industry, there is little evidence that the scale has increased markedly in recent years. While traffickers and exploiters can earn premium prices on girls, having sex with minors has become less acceptable in much of Europe. As Julia O'Connell Davidson (1998) argues, while there is a small market for sex with children, many customers in the larger adult sex market are not that discriminating about age. This logic suggests that young women, aged 13 to 15, are the most likely recruits for the western European sex industries. One recent study (O'Brien

et al., 2004) highlights the difficulties of tracing these patterns, as the seven countries examined – Albania, Belarus, the Czech Republic, Moldova, Romania, Russia, and the Ukraine – currently lack the capacity to ensure accurate official record keeping and thus cannot identify children as a separate category.

Too little attention has been paid to the trafficking of children into domestic service and other forms of bonded labour within Europe, although substantial documentation of it in other regions can be found through the International Labour Organization (ILO) and UNICEF, including analysis of how complex and intersecting local traditions and practices with respect to slavery, child labour, and fosterage can provide contexts in which trafficking can emerge and become embedded. Perhaps most important, however, is the limited attention that has been paid to how living in a context with high levels of irregular migration affects children, who may become involved in trafficking as a family group, through being sold or being present in the contexts where daily recruitment takes place (Kelly, 2005). Beyond these direct engagements is a much wider impact of trafficking and migration on the far greater numbers of children whose parents have sought employment elsewhere. They are vulnerable here to neglect and mistreatment by the adults in whose care they are left, especially when parents do not or cannot remit money for their upkeep.

The feminization of migration at the close of the twentieth century has led feminist commentators to ask whether the relative freedom of women in the West is being bought at the cost of exploitation of those from the South (Ehrenreich and Hochschild, 2003). Within the globalization of household labour, particular nationalities, rather than women per se, are being constructed as "naturally" suited to this work (Ehrenreich and Hochschild, 2003), sometimes travelling half way around the globe to care for other women's children, while leaving their own in the care of impoverished relatives. This disjunction of childhoods has prompted questions about whether a "care deficit" is emerging in the global South, and what the consequences of this will be for the current generation of children.

HIERARCHIES OF WORTH

Comparing findings across studies highlights differential pricing regimes both for the range of services and journeys, but also what is charged in the same country for individuals from different countries of origin. Further attention to the economics of human trafficking is surely needed, where short journeys into neighbouring countries (for example by boat from Morocco to Spain or Mexico to the United States) may cost 500 euros, whereas lengthy and more complex processes of moving people, for example, from China to western Europe or the United States can cost up to 30,000 euros (Banerjee, 2003). The lengthier and

more expensive the journey, the greater the indebtedness and dependency of the migrants, which in turn creates higher levels of vulnerability to exploitation. At the same time, it may be that some networks are more interested in smuggling than trafficking, or vice versa. Explicating the macro- and microeconomic factors involved, from the perspective of traffickers and trafficked persons, should be a research priority. It may be, for example, that the premium prices for travel into western Europe create more extensive conditions of exploitation.

The pattern of sale and resale of women trafficked into the sex industry seems increasingly common in Europe. In the recent Turkish study a trafficker openly admitted that women are sold in "sales-like auctions" (Erder and Kaska, 2003: 63); literally dealing with women as commodities has also been documented in Bosnia and Kosovo (see also Corrin, 2000, Human Rights Watch, 2002). A more common pattern is revealed in the accounts of trafficked women, some of whom talk of being sold more than 20 times (Kelly, 2005). It is unclear whether this is a way sex businesses circulate women and/or a mechanism to ensure maximum exploitation, as it ensures debts are never paid off. The differential pricing of trafficked persons – across various forms of human trafficking – reflects processes of both commodification and racism. For example, higher prices are charged (and wages paid) to Filipina maids in the Gulf states than those from Sri Lanka, sex business owners pay more for Slavic women than those from the Caucasus (Shelley, 2002b), and hierarchies exist in relation to the bonded labour systems in construction in Russia (Kelly, 2005). The "worth" of persons is thus reduced to a financial calculation, with meanings and consequences at the level of identity and the symbolic rarely noted.

The emphasis on assessing assistance and documenting the experiential aspects of trafficking, perhaps accompanied by a view of victims as lacking agency and therefore unable to escape, has meant that very limited work has addressed ways people extricate themselves from exploitation. Owing money that one has borrowed from one's relatives appears to entrap in a particularly remorseless way, and applies across all forms of trafficking (Kelly, 2005), as returning with nothing, not even enough to repay the debt, is unacceptable to many, involving too great a loss of face and/or irresolvable guilt at having not only failed to improve family fortunes but made them worse. In such contexts being re-trafficked may be preferred to returning empty handed to one's family/community.[12]

Some routes out of exploitation are also problematic. Most studies that address law enforcement responses reveal that significant proportions of the women detected in prostitution are treated as illegal migrants, and are frequently held in prisons and detention centres for weeks and months. This becomes especially daunting for women from countries without diplomatic missions in destination

countries and who have yet to negotiate reciprocal arrangements with other countries. Similarly, some countries of origin often cannot afford, or choose not, to fly their citizens home, preferring to issue bus and train tickets – much more possible across Europe than some other routes – which in turn make people much more vulnerable to re-trafficking (Hughes and Denisova, 2001: 15). One journalist, Martin (2003), presents strong evidence that corrupt officials alert traffickers when women are being returned. Such treatment indicates perceptions of these women as "worth less" than others; the combination of irregular migration and prostitution somehow not only excusing treatment that is the opposite of that expected under the UN protocol, but also justifying states taking less than swift and determined efforts to identify and ensure the return of their citizens. It is a link between women's NGOs in Israel and Uzbekistan that identifies trafficked Uzbek women in Israeli prisons, some of whom have been there for months, and even years.

"IS IT A CRIME TO SELL WOMEN? THEY SELL FOOTBALLERS DON'T THEY?":[13] A FOCUS ON TRAFFICKERS AND EXPLOITERS

It is less than simple to study traffickers who have every reason for wishing to remain hidden from scrutiny (Tailby, 2001). Adding to the difficulties is the fact that trafficking is a dynamic, moving target, connected to local circumstances, while adapting rapidly to global shifts in opportunities and enforcement (UNDOC, 2003). What we do know is that there are large, complex, and transnational groups alongside more nebulous networks that form alliances for particular projects, and smaller emergent groupings that tend to operate in specific locations (Bagley, 2001). In this section more recent insights and questions are explored alongside two typologies that deserve empirical testing and extension.

One connection worthy of more detailed research is the extent to which the scale of human trafficking is associated with established organized crime networks and corruption, including what the precise mechanisms involved are and whether these extend across all forms of trafficking in persons. Correlations with respect to high flows for trafficking for sexual exploitation and regional reputations for corruption and organized criminal networks have been noted across the globe (e.g. Ukraine (Hughes and Denisova, 2001), Nigeria (Pearson, 2003), and Thailand (Phongpaichit et al., 1998)). The Thai study is to be commended for the attempt to investigate the connections more explicitly, including heavy financial investments in political parties and individual politicians to ensure counter-trafficking efforts are ineffective.[14] The extensiveness of organized crime, and its penetration of the political sphere, have prompted complex questions about the state and civil society, especially in transition states (Kleveman, 2003).

Emerging data suggest a strong presence in Western democracies with, for example, police in the Netherlands reporting that between 1997 and 2000 there were 1,350 people traffickers operating, earning 118 million euros, while 65 per cent of the women they exploited earned nothing (cited in Hughes and Denisova, 2001: 16).

Whether human beings are treated like any other commodity is a moot point; it may apply to those who specialize in recruitment and transportation, but within a more integrated system where traffickers also profit from the exploitation element, a less cavalier attitude to the welfare of individuals is probably preferred. With respect to sexual exploitation in Europe it is currently thought that women are usually sold by middlemen when they come from south-eastern Europe (SEE) (Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003), although Albanian traffickers have increasingly taken over sex businesses along their trafficking routes. How these patterns are reflected with respect to domestic service and labour exploitation is unclear, although integrated models appear common in trafficking from China. While lacking sound economic data on the scale of earnings/profit involved in either smuggling or trafficking, Shelley (2001) reports on translation of accounts of Chinese traffickers, who were primarily transporting men for labour exploitation. They made 90 per cent profit on each person, with the largest expenses being bribes to officials en route and very high payments to a US lawyer.

All of these aspects of organization and practice feature in the two typologies that follow: one from the UN Drugs and Crime (UNDOC) (2002) section covers organized crime in general whereas Louise Shelley and her colleagues (2003a) focus on trafficking in persons. Each model has five variants, and summaries are presented in Table 1. UNDOC argue that assessments by police and others have underestimated the harm caused by smaller groups, and consequently paid insufficient attention to them (2002: 33). Russian (perhaps even CIS) groups are considered unique since they involve former senior security staff, who already have extensive experience in evading legal controls alongside expertise in practices such as money laundering (Shelley, 2002b). Both note differences between integrated groups that control the entire trafficking process and those who sell/facilitate only one part of the process. Louise Shelley (2002b) emphasizes that the least investment the traffickers have in the person, the more brutal they are prepared to be, although the Balkan groups appear to be an exception, combining integration and excessive cruelty. There is a clear need to develop and expand upon these outlines through integrating other forms of human trafficking more strongly and interrogating features thought to represent differences and similarities between them. A stronger typology, which also has purchase on regional differences and organizational forms, would aid the development of more nuanced law enforcement and prevention strategies.

TABLE 1

TWO TYPOLOGIES OF ORGANIZED CRIME/
HUMAN TRAFFICKING NETWORKS

UN Drugs and Crime Typology Organized Crime	Louise Shelley Typology Human trafficking
Standard Hierarchy (most common – China and Eastern Europe) ▪ Single leader ▪ Clear hierarchy ▪ Internal discipline ▪ Named group ▪ Social/ethnic identity ▪ Violence integral ▪ Influence/control over particular territory Regional hierarchy (Japan and Italy) ▪ Single leader ▪ Line of command ▪ Some regional autonomy ▪ Geographical reach ▪ Multiple activities ▪ Often social/ethnic identity ▪ Violence integral	Natural Resource Model (post-Soviet organized crime) ▪ Primarily trafficking in women ▪ Use like natural resource ▪ Sell to near trading partners ▪ High violence and human rights abuses ▪ Often "break" women before leave country of origin Trade and Development (China) ▪ Mainly smuggling of men for labour exploitation, 10 percent women ▪ Control all stages to maximize profit ▪ Some profit invested in legitimate entrepreneurship in Thailand and China ▪ Less abuse and violence as have investment in continued profit
Clustered hierarchy (least common) ▪ Number of groups ▪ Stronger as network ▪ System of governance ▪ Some autonomy ▪ Link to a social/historical context	Supermarket – low cost, high volume (Mexico) ▪ Facilitate illegal entry across border ▪ Small fees, large numbers ▪ Extent of failures, need for multiple attempts keeps fees low ▪ Investment patterns similar to those of migrants – into land and property
Core group (3 in western Europe) ▪ Core group surrounded by loose network ▪ Limited numbers ▪ Tight, flat structure	Violent Entrepreneurs (Balkans) ▪ Almost all trafficking in women ▪ Middlemen for Russian organized crime ▪ Increasingly integrated as take over sex businesses in destination countries ▪ Involvement of top level law enforcement in own countries ▪ Use profits to finance other illegal activities, and invest in property and business elsewhere ▪ Considerable violence
Criminal network ▪ Linking activities of individuals ▪ Position by virtue of networks and skills ▪ Personal loyalties ▪ Alliances around projects ▪ Low public profile	Traditional slavery with modern technology (Nigeria and West Africa) ▪ Multi-faceted crime groups ▪ Use female recruiters and trade in girls and young women into street prostitution ▪ Small amounts returned to local operators and families to maintain flow

An emergent theme is the potential link between organized crime,[15] globalization, trafficking, and global security. This is a major issue for Europe, both in terms of the countries where crime groups are based, where the illicit economy acts as a break on both the movement out of economic transition and democratization processes, and on the Western countries where organized crime has taken advantage of diasporas to put down roots. The Netherlands, for example, has identified 100 different ethnically organized crime groups operating within its borders (Shelley, 2003b). The links to global insecurity in terms of terrorism are more distal, with an overview essay pointing out that while traffickers and terrorists might use the same methods, they have entirely different, and incommensurate, ends (Shelley and Picarelli, 2002). The researchers do, however, conclude that "transnational criminals are the major beneficiaries of globalization" (2002: 306), and that there is considerable power and destabilizing potential, not just in terms of the growing illicit global economy, but also the stakes that some groups now have in national economies through the privatization of state assets in the 1990s. At the same time, the major activities of organized crime continue to be smuggling/trafficking of goods and people. The scale of money made from these activities is hard to gauge, but one estimate of money laundering is between US$500 billion to a trillion annually (Shelley et al., 2003: 152). There are also seeds of exploration of what happens to the proceeds, both the earnings of those who are smuggled and trafficked, and the profits accrued by traffickers. With respect to the former research on remittances, while demonstrating its importance for many economies, it has yet to demonstrate that trafficked persons are able to remit at the same levels as irregular migrants (Sen and Kelly, 2004). In terms of traffickers, their income has been a source of development capital in Asia, which has not been the case in the former Soviet Union, reflecting the short-term, raider mentality that followed privatization of state-run business. In this case, trafficking has also drained human capital, as a high proportion of those trafficked are educated women (Shelley, 2002b: 215).

More sophisticated understandings

The last three years have witnessed the emergence of more sophisticated approaches to trafficking, with studies placing it within both localized anthropological and historical perspectives, and drawing more on contemporary political economy. Regional patterns have been connected to cultural attitudes on labour, gender, and childhood along with more specific trade and geographic links between origin, transit, and destination countries. Criminal networks have historic roots – of kin, ethnicity, or tribe – coupled with alertness to contemporary conditions and practices. As Shelley (2003a) points out, the scale of human trafficking requires highly paid facilitators in destination countries, employers prepared to use exploited labour and the collusion, if not corruption, of the

private sector. The conditions needed to facilitate trafficking, therefore, require the combination of a favourable political economy, cultural supports, and the criminal element.

A variety of concepts from political science have provided useful windows on the processes involved in trafficking, including illegal/unregulated markets (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2003b; Aronowitz, 2001), and the impacts of trafficking and organized crime on political systems, sovereignty, and political economy (Long, 2002). In terms of political economy, Shelley (2002b) analyses a "transnational political criminal nexus", which she conceptualizes on multiple levels, that facilitates trafficking. At the most extreme end of the continuum are states which can be said to have been criminalized,[16] and where civil society has been weakened/corrupted (Stoecker, 2003) to the extent that large numbers of people are implicated in the trafficking process. At the other end are societies, such as the Netherlands, where the sex industry has become a significant element in the national economy, and is difficult to challenge/regulate for that reason.[17] Most states are positioned at points in between, with the extent of corruption not just undermining the effectiveness of law enforcement,[18] but also corroding trust in governance, engendering fatalism in disaffected and disempowered citizens (SEERIGHTS, 2003). One commentator notes that in the CIS states "democratic transition has been derailed by institutionalized corruption and organized crime penetration of the state" (Shelley, 2002a: 73) and that this has facilitated trafficking.[19]

Documentation of conducive contexts often links the strategic location of a country/area/region and aspects of poor/inadequate legal regulation. For example, the absence of regulation of prostitution in the Czech Republic enabled huge growth of a sex market along the extensive border with Germany, in what is now termed a "brothel belt" (O'Brien et al., 2004). Estonia was similarly positioned with respect to Scandinavia. War and conflict have also been implicated, as they increase vulnerability and decrease protection, especially where civilian populations, predominantly women and children, begin to move (Moore, 2001). Internal displacement that includes border crossings offers opportunities for traffickers. Disorganized post-conflict situations seem to be especially conducive, most extensively documented in Europe in the break up of former Yugoslavia (Human Rights Watch, 2002; Amnesty International, 2004). The late twentieth-century twist, regretfully acknowledged by the UN (2005), has been the involvement of "peacekeepers" – both the military and the civilians employed for security and reconstruction – as customers and in a few documented cases, as traffickers. While there is documentation of staff being removed from their posts, very few prosecutions have taken place, and it is unclear how attempts to regulate the behaviour of soldiers and staff of international agencies through codes of conduct are being implemented and monitored (Human Rights Watch, 2002).

At the cultural level, practices based on inequalities of gender, generation, and ethnicity – such as bride price, dowry, ritual prostitution,[20] child marriage, and fosterage – also provide fertile ground for trafficking (Banerjee, 2003; IOM, 2004). Where a social group is marked in this way through traditions and status hierarchies, there are no easy transitions to alternative livelihoods, making the girls from this group especially vulnerable to recruitment. Two studies explore prostitution regimes and the links to trafficking (Bindel and Kelly, 2003; Regeringskansliet, 2003). Both argue that legalization of brothel prostitution has not, and cannot, provide a solution to trafficking: trafficking is as, if not more, frequent in countries with elements of legalized prostitution and trafficked women end up in the less safe contexts of the street or illegal brothels.

One area where more sophisticated understandings are still needed is in the representation of, and research with, those who have been trafficked. The deployment of the concept of "victim" is too often within a context that implicitly suggests powerlessness. In fact, most trafficking victims continue to exercise agency, but in contexts where their options and possibilities are severely constrained. There is little documentation to date of how people escape – sometimes in mundane ways, others are more dramatic – and the routes by which they manage to return to their families/communities. While diasporas have been discussed with reference to traffickers, there is some documentation (Kelly, 2005) of migrants from the same countries/ethnic groups acting as support networks and even providing small amounts of money to enable return, or acting as facilitators into slightly less exploitative conditions.

OUT OF SIGHT, OUT OF MIND

Journeys of Jeopardy noted the lack of research evaluation of counter-trafficking initiatives, and the tendency of publications to do little more than describe current provision. Recent publications continue this trend, albeit organizing material under the US Department of State *Trafficking in Persons Report* framework of prevention, prosecution, and protection (Goodey, 2003; Smatt, 2003). Other overviews document protection in ten European countries (Apap, 2003), or support and return programmes (Stiftelsen Kvinnoforum, 2003; van der Kleij, 2002). None of these reports involves the development of a methodology which would allow evaluation and comparison of interventions.

Law enforcement responses across Europe continue to be understaffed and under-resourced (Laczko, 2002) even in rich Western countries. A critical analysis of Plans of Action in SEE argues they are steps forward, but lack a clear strategy, sustainable structures, or specified tasks and timelines (Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003: 19), with those who carry the counter-trafficking brief in minis-

tries and agencies having this in addition to many other responsibilities. Policy tensions between Ministries continue to undermine counter-trafficking efforts. For example, in Turkey (Erder and Kaska, 2003) law enforcement have to defer to the Ministry of Tourism, which has responsibility for the hotels and bars where much prostitution takes place; a senior official in the Ministry commented that he was just fulfilling the enormous demand for entertainment visas.

Service development in SEE was linked to whether countries were primarily origin, transit, or destination. Countries of origin mainly had return programmes, whereas those with transit and destination outcomes focused on repatriation. The primary services were shelter-based, with 26 in the region, and a total of 300 bed spaces. Most are short-term, with average stays of between two weeks and two months (Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003). Most are funded by international donors, with local NGO implementers and minimal engagement by national governments; provision is primarily for those who are willing to return to their countries of origin and little, if anything, caters specifically for minors. There is minimal follow up of women who are returned and only three reintegration centres in the entire region – Albania, Romania, and Moldova – with one allowing stays of up to two years, and the others limited to three months. Little educational input is provided, although there has been some increase in vocational and employment components recently (Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003: 23). Legal advocacy is rare, and the majority of trafficked women who give court testimony in SEE have never had legal advice. Most states in the region signed a commitment in 2002 in Tirana to regularize the status of victims and provide temporary residence permits (Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003: 24), but like their EU neighbours with respect to a similar directive, the majority have yet to fulfil this commitment. Given the lack of employment and access to housing for women in the region, let alone the impact of sexual exploitation, one can conclude that despite a large amount of positive rhetoric from the EU and politicians there remains a systemic failure to provide adequate support to trafficked women who are returned from western to central and Eastern Europe.

This limited investment in support and law enforcement is all the more regrettable, as evidence continues to show that high quality and extensive NGO support can enable women to press charges: The Hearth in Vlore, Albania, has supported women to press charges against 497 individuals (Martin, 2003), although only seven cases have been brought by the police to court. There are also indications that hotlines may be a cost-effective intervention (Kelly, 2002).

OLD DEBATES, NEW DIRECTIONS

While discussions of trafficking have moved into new and more sophisticated domains, currently it is not clear whether this will result in a more informed

interdisciplinary exploration or merely more complex competition for discursive control of the issue.

Unresolved debates about prostitution, especially as rehearsed within feminist/gender studies, continue to be played out through the lens of trafficking. For example Jo Dozema (2002) criticizes the UN protocol on the grounds that it precludes the choice to migrate for sex work, Laura Agustin (2003) appears to want to abandon the concept of victimization altogether, and Wendy Chapkis (2003) argues that the Trafficking Victims Protection Act in the United States created a moral panic. Within these exchanges the voices of trafficked women themselves are muted to say the least, and many have no opportunity to participate because speaking out can literally endanger their future safety, as their inclusion in their own communities requires that they pay a further price of not discussing what they have endured (Bales, 2003; Kelly, 2002). Women trafficked from Islamic countries face being charged with adultery, including those who, without realizing the implications, convert in order to legitimize temporary marriages. In other contexts, such as Afghanistan, the current security situation and gender order continue to limit women's autonomy and undermine opportunities for denouncing sexual exploitation (IOM, 2004). It is, however, imperative that those who are subjected to trafficking are part of the debate, meaning that research offering confidentiality, conducted by independent researchers, continues to be a priority.

Most exploitation takes place in destination countries, many of which are proud of their human rights records – this surely makes it even more vital that the issue of demand is addressed (see also ILO, 2003b), and that this extends to demand for exploitable labour, rather than only those who are trafficked (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2003). We also need to make more links, not only across forms of human trafficking but also with other areas, such as child marriage (Mikhail, 2002) and sustainable development agendas (Laczko, 2003; Poudel and Smyth, 2002). Just as the Bangladesh Thematic Group (2004) argues for a new generation of concepts, we need a new generation of research, asking slightly different questions and a more inclusive sense of the research field.

Rather than repeat studies focused on countries or region, we need to move on to explore identified questions and issues which may cut across the preferred distinctions between trafficking and smuggling. For example, we need to investigate the illegal/sham employment and travel agencies that facilitate smuggling and act as agents/brokers for traffickers. A multi-country study of how these groups operate, especially the extent to which they are implicated across all forms of smuggling and trafficking of human beings, or whether there are

specializations, would enhance our understanding; as would a critical assessment of the reluctance of many governments to regulate their operation. Conducting a prospective study of assistance and return for a large enough sample over time, so that differences in experiences, inputs, and outcomes could be systematically tracked, would not only enhance understanding of whether any of the current provision actually "works", but also offer information on the ways informal networks respond and the longer-term support needs that people have, neither of which have been systematically documented. Similarly, undertaking ethnographic research in specialist law enforcement units in origin, transit, and destination countries would undoubtedly illuminate why so few successful prosecutions are mounted.

The examples above are part of a call for research agenda that is driven by the wish to answer a troubling question and/or draw on methodological and theoretical frameworks from a range of academic disciplines. Donors and funders may need convincing with respect to the knowledge gains from such investments, and that studies addressing all forms of trafficking in persons might provide critically important insights. For instance, understanding the scale of irregular migration (and trafficking) into domestic work and other unskilled sectors offers a different position from which to assess deceptive recruitment into the sex industry: this is the context in which women are making decisions about offers, and judging their veracity, where smuggling is extensive and cheap female labour widely sought. Extending our thinking also requires recognizing that many will continue to accept offers of work, despite prevention campaigns, because the scale of need and of recruitment is so extensive.

Social researchers also have to continue to ask the hard questions. An emerging consensus between major UN agencies and some academics appears to be that managed migration will provide the best solution to trafficking. There are strong arguments for more transparent and open migration regimes, but the assertion that this constitutes a counter-trafficking strategy needs to be subjected to serious scrutiny. While managed migration could have an impact on smuggling, if the legitimate routes expanded substantially, it is rather optimistic to presume that the organized crime groups would simply disappear. The integrated trafficking model, where traffickers make profit from both the movement and later exploitation of the trafficked person would seem the least likely to be affected. Such a perspective also fails to ask critical questions about demand itself. Bridgit Anderson and Julia O'Connell Davidson (2003a) argue that demand is culturally and socially constructed – it has to be created and grown for a market to exist and expand. Human beings *…have to learn to imagine that it would be pleasurable to pay a stranger for sex, that it would be convenient and pleasant to have another person to clean up after them* (2003a: 25).

Accepting the patterns of globalized labour also involves accepting processes of racism and "otherization" that are built into current patterns of migrant labour:

> Women and girls who belong to groups that are in general socially devalued, and socially and politically and economically marginalized are also devalued by both employers and clients, and thus socially constructed as the "natural" or "ideal" occupants of the lowest positions in domestic and sex work (2003a: 27).

The question we all have to ask is whether managed migration will serve to normalize patterns based on systematic inequalities, while offering little change for those who continue to be smuggled and/or trafficked. The current knowledge base suggests that the levels of exploitation can be gross, the assistance sparse, and the consequences negative for the health and welfare of the individual and their family.

NOTES

1. These distinctions in part reflect those found in other literature, and also specify different contexts in which individuals are exploited.
2. (a) "Trafficking in persons" shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs;
   (b) The consent of a victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) have been used;
   (c) The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered "trafficking in persons" even if this does not involve any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article.
3. There is far less research and commentary on smuggling.
4. The fall in baseline estimates and more muted rhetoric is reflected in claims about the extent of profit derived from human trafficking; most recent publications place it second to drugs and arms, rather than equalling or exceeding them (Shelley, 2001).
5. The 2003 report states "The new figures were generated from a database that examined reports of specific trafficking incidents, counts of repatriated victims, estimates for victims worldwide, and victim demographics derived from analysis

of information from press, governments, non-governmental and international organizations, and academic reports from 2000 to the present" (2003: 8)

6. The author has reviewed two academic journal papers in 2004 that made this argument, although neither has appeared in print to date.
7. From an interview with an IOM staff member in February 2004, in preparation for a training course in Addis Ababa.
8. They are allowed in specified areas, anyone working in them has to be at least 21 years old and undergo regular medical examinations.
9. This is the pattern represented in the film Lilja 4-ever (2002).
10. This is further illustrated by research from Thailand, where despite three decades of families living off income from sisters, daughters, and mothers who worked in the sex industry, it is still considered shameful to have been in prostitution, and many women find it impossible to reintegrate and/or marry. Rather than face such isolation "at home", they stay in Japan, "choosing" to be part of an ethnic group that is marginalized, segregated, and discriminated against (Chuntjitkaruna, 2000); they take a Japanese name, but stay in their tiny apartment most of the time, for fear they may be detected and deported.
11. There are important knowledge transfers and lessons here from work on other forms of violence against women, where some elements of victim blame have been successfully undermined, while others persist.
12. There is little documentation of this in the literature, but the author has heard accounts of such calculations by recently returned women and men from front line workers in Africa and Central Asia.
13. An Albanian trafficker cited in Martin (2003).
14. The extent to which there is systematic corruption in the international and NGOs sectors has not been studied (Shelley et al., 2003), although an exploratory examination has been commissioned by IOM.
15. A useful definition is that used by the FBI: "continuing and self-perpetuating criminal conspiracy, having an organized structure, fed by fear and corruption and motivated by greed" (cited in Shelley et al., 2003: 145).
16. Sometimes referred to as "kleptocracies".
17. Hughes and Denisova (2003: 16) cite figures from the Dutch police which suggest it accounts for 5 per cent of the national economy.
18. An example here is provided in a paper by Kathleen Maltzhan (2002), through the story of Ella, who escaped a brothel in the Philippines. She was determined that the many other women there should also be freed, and after huge efforts convinced an NGO to act and demand the police act. Unfortunately the traffickers were warned on two separate occasions, so that when the raids took place everyone had been removed.
19. A similar argument is made about Thailand in Phongpaichit et al., 2003. Publication of the book was delayed following intimidation of the authors.
20. Including *devadasi*, *basavi* and *jogin* in India, *trokosi* in Africa, and *Kamayani* in Nepal where certain tribes provide concubines for the royal family.

REFERENCES

Agustin, L.
2003 "Forget victimization: granting agency to migrants", *Development*, 46(3): 30-36.

Anderson, B.
2000 *Doing the Dirty Work? The Global Politics of Domestic Labour*, Zed, London.

Anderson, B., and J. O'Connell Davidson
2003a *Is Trafficking in Human Beings Demand Driven?: A Multi-Country Pilot Study*, IOM, Geneva.
2003b *Demand for Trafficked Persons Labour/Services: A Multi-Country Pilot Study*, Draft Final Report.

Apap, J.
2003 *Protection Schemes for Victims of Trafficking from Selected EU Member, Candidate and Third Countries*, IOM, Geneva.

Aronowitz, A.
2001 "Smuggling and trafficking in human beings: the phenomenon, the markets that drive it and the organizations that promote it", *European Journal of Criminal Policy and Research*, 9(2): 163-195.

Bagley, B.
2001 *Globalization and Transnational Organized Crime: The Russian Mafia in Latin America and the Caribbean*, Mama Coca, www.mamacoca.org.

Bales, K.
2003 "Because she looks like a child", in B. Ehrenreich and A. Hochschild (Eds), *Global Woman: Nannies, Maids and Sex Workers in the New Economy*, Granta, London: 207-229.

Banerjee, U.
2003 "Globalization, crisis in livelihoods, migration and trafficking of women and girls: the crisis in India, Nepal and Bangladesh", unpublished paper.

Bangladesh Thematic Group on Trafficking
2004 *Revisiting the Human Trafficking Paradigm: The Bangladesh Experience (Part I: Trafficking of Adults)*, IOM, Geneva.

Bindel, J., and L. Kelly
2003 *A Critical Examination of Response to Prostitution in Four Countries: Victoria, Australia, Ireland, the Netherlands and Sweden*, Routes Out Partnership, Glasgow.

Chammartin, G
2003 *Women Migrant Workers' Protection in Arab League States*, ILO, Geneva.

Chapkis, W.
2003 "Trafficking, migration and the law: protecting innocents, punishing immigrants", *Gender and Society*, 17(6): 923-937.

Chunjitkaruna, P.
2000 "Pitfalls and problems in the search for a better life: Thai migrant worker in Japan", in S. Chantavanich et al. (Eds), *Thai Migrant Workers in East and Southeast Asia 1996-1997*, Asian Research Center for Migration, Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok.

Corrin, C.
2000 "Local particularities – international generalities: traffic in women in Central and South Eastern Europe", *European Consortium for Political Research*, Copenhagen, 14-19 April.

Ehrenreich, B., and A. Hochschild (Eds)
2003 *Global Woman: Nannies, Maids and Sex Workers in the New Economy*, Granta, London.

Eltis, D.
2002 *Coerced and Free Migration: Global Perspectives*, Stanford University Press, Stanford.

Erder, S., and S. Kaska
2003 *Irregular Migration and Trafficking in Women: The Case of Turkey,* IOM, Geneva.

Ginzberg, O.
2003 *Trace: Trafficking from Community to Exploitation – Project Report*, UNICEF, New York.

Goodey, J.
2003 "Migration, crime and victimhood: responses to sex trafficking in the EU", *Punishment and Society*, 5(4): 415-431.

Hughes, D.
2002 "The corruption of civil society: maintaining the flow of women to the sex industries", *Encunetro Internacional Sobre Trafico De Mujures y Explotacion*, Malaga, 23 September.
2004 "Sex slave jihad", *FrontPageMagazine.com*, 27 January, www.frontpagemag.com/Articles.

Hughes, D., and T. Denisova
2001 "The transnational political criminal nexus of trafficking in women from Ukraine", *Trends in Organized Crime*, 6(3-4): 2-21.

Human Rights Watch
2000 *Owed Justice: Thai Women Trafficked into Debt Bondage in Japan*, Human Rights Watch, New York.
2002 *Hopes Betrayed: Trafficking of Women and Girls to Post-Conflict Bosnia and Herzegovina for Forced Prostitution,* Human Rights Watch, New York.

Hunzinger, L., and P. Coffey
2003 *First Annual Report on Victims of Trafficking in South-Eastern Europe,* IOM Regional Clearing Point, Vienna.

International Labour Organization (ILO)
2003a *Forced Labour Outcomes of Irregular Migration and Human Trafficking in Europe*, ILO, Geneva.
2003b *Trafficking in Human Beings: New Approaches to Combating the Problem*, ILO-MIGRANT, Geneva.

International Labour Organization (ILO) Mekong Subregional Project
2001 *Labour Migration and Trafficking with the Greater Mekong Subregion,* ILO, Bangkok.

International Organization for Migration (IOM)
2004 *Trafficking in Persons: An Analysis of Afghanistan*, IOM, Geneva.

International Organization for Migration (IOM)/International Catholic Migration Commission (ICMC)
2002 *Research Report on Third Country National Trafficking Victims in Albania*, IOM, Tirana.
Kangaspunta, K.
2003 "Mapping the inhuman trade: preliminary findings of the database on trafficking in human beings", *Forum on Crime and Society*, 3(1-2): 81-101.
Keeler, L., and M. Jyrkinen (Eds)
1999 *Who's Buying: The Clients of Prostitution*, Ministry of Social Affairs, Helsinki.
Kelly, L.
1987 *Surviving Sexual Violence*, Polity Press, Cambridge.
2002 *Journeys of Jeopardy: A Review of Research on Trafficking in Women and Children in Europe*, IOM, Geneva.
2003 "The wrong debate: reflections on why force is not the key issue with respect to trafficking in women for sexual exploitation", *Feminist Review: Exile and Asylum – Women Seeking Refuge in "Fortress Europe"*, 73: 139-144.
2005 *Fertile Fields: Trafficking in Persons in Central Asia,* IOM Regional Clearing Point, Vienna.
Kleveman, L.
2003 *The New Great Game: Blood and Oil in Central Asia*, Atlantic Books, London.
Laczko, F.
2002 "Human trafficking: the need for better data", *Migration Information Source*, November, http://www.migrationinformation.org.
Lesko, V., and E. Avdulaj
2003 *Girls and Trafficking: Review of Trafficking in Human Beings for 2002*, Psycho-Social Centre, The Hearth, Vlore.
Levekron, N.
2001a *Trafficking in Women in Israel: An Updated Report – 2001*, Hotline for Migrant Workers, Tel Aviv.
2001b *Trafficking in Israel: The Legal and Human Dimensions*, www.protectionproject.org/vt/ns.htm.
Long, L.
2002 "Trafficking in women as a security challenge in Southeast Europe", *Journal of Southeast Europe and Black Sea Studies*, 2(2): 53-68.
Maltzahn, K.
2001 "Trafficking of women in prostitution", *Australian Women Speak*, www.osw.dpmc.gov.au/resources/conference/trafficking_in _women.html.
2002 "Policing trafficking in women for prostitution", unpublished paper.
Martin, L.
2003 "One woman is healing the scars of Albania's sex slaves", *The Herald*, 3 November, http://www.theherald.co.uk/features/3540-print.shtml.

Mattar, M.
2001 "Commercial sexual exploitation of women: the Islamic law perspective", http://www.protectionproject.org/vt/mm.htm.
2003a "Trafficking in persons, especially women and children, in countries of the Middle East: the scope of the problem and the appropriate legislative responses", *Fordham International Law Journal*, 26: 721.
2003b "Monitoring the status of severe forms of trafficking in foreign countries: sanctions mandated under the US Trafficking Victims Protection Act", *Brown Journal of World Affairs*, X(1): 159-178.

Mikhail, S.
2002 "Child marriage and child prostitution: two forms of sexual exploitation", *Gender and Development: Special Issue – Trafficking and Slavery*, 10(1).

Moore, C.
2001 "Trafficking in women and children and in war and war-like conditions", www.protectionproject/seminar_series.

Morrison, J., and B. Crosland
2001 "The trafficking and smuggling of refugees: the end game in European asylum policy?", *New Issues in Refugee Research*, Working Paper 39, UNHCR, Geneva.

O'Brien, M., et al.
2004 *Joint East West Research on Trafficking in Children for Sexual Purposes in Europe: The Sending Countries*, ECPAT Europe Law Enforcement Group, Amsterdam.

O'Connell Davidson, J.
1998 *Prostitution, Power and Freedom*, Polity Press, Cambridge.

Pearson, E.
2003 *Study on Trafficking in Women in East Africa*, GTZ, Eschborn, www.gtz.de/traffickinginwomen.

Phongpaichit, P., et al.
1998 *Guns, Girls, Gambling and Ganja: Thailand's Illegal Economy and Public Policy*, Silkworm Books, Chang Mai.

Poppy Project
2004 *When Women Are Trafficked: Quantifying the Gendered Experience of Trafficking in the UK*, http://www.poppy.ik.com.

Poudel, M., and I. Smith
2002 "Reducing poverty, upholding human rights: a pragmatic approach", *Gender and Development: Special Issue – Trafficking and Slavery*, 10(1).

Rathgeber, C.
2002 "The victimization of women through human trafficking – an aftermath of war?", *European Journal of Crime, Criminal Law and Criminal Justice,* 10(2-3): 152-163.

Regeringskansliet
2003 *The Effects of Legalization of Prostitution Activities – A Critical Analysis*, Ministry of Justice, Stockholm.

Rousseaux, F.
2003 "The psychological impact of sexual slavery of trafficked women: parallels with torture, sexual abuse and domestic violence", *Violence Against Women: An Australian Feminist Journal*, July: 4-13.

SEERIGHTS
2003 "Albania: migration, prostitution and trafficking", SEERIGHTs, http://seerights.org/main.php?val=249.

Sen, P., and L. Kelly
2004 *Benefits, Beneficiaries and Harms: A Critical Overview of Human Trafficking and Smuggling as Lost Potentials for Poverty Alleviation and the Promotion of MDGs*, unpublished report to DFID.

Shelley, L.
2001 "Trafficking and smuggling in human beings", paper at *Corruption Within Security Forces: A Threat to National Security Conference*, Garmisch, 14-18 May.
2002a "Crime as the defining problem: voices of another criminology", *International Annals of Criminology*, 39(1-2): 73-88.
2002b "The changing position of women: trafficking, crime and corruption", in D. Lane (Ed.), *The Legacy of State Socialism and the Future of Transformation*, Rowman and Littlefield: 207-222.
2003a "Trafficking in women: the business model approach", *The Brown Journal of World Affairs*, X(1): 119-131.
2003b Statement to US Senate Committee on Foreign Relations, Hearing on Combating Transnational and Corruption in Europe, 30 October.
2003c "The trade in people in and from the former Soviet Union", *Crime, Law and Social Change*, 40(2-3): 231-249.

Shelley, L., and J. Picarelli
2002 "Methods not motives: implications of the convergence of international organized crime and terrorism", *Police Practice and Research*, 3(4): 305-318.

Shelley, L., et al.
2003 "Global crime inc.", in M. Love (Ed.), *Beyond Sovereignty: Issues for a Global Agenda*, Wadsworth, California: 143-166.

Smartt, U.
2003 "Human trafficking: simply a European problem?", *European Journal of Crime, Criminal Law and Criminal Justice*, 11(2): 164-177.

Stiftelsen Kvinnoforum
2003 *European Good Practice on Recovery, Return and Integration of Trafficked Persons*, Kvinnoforum, Stockholm.

Stoecker, S.
2002 "The rise in human trafficking and the role of organized crime", unpublished paper.

Tialby, R.
2001 "Organized crime and people smuggling/trafficking to Australia", *Trends and Issues in Crime and Criminal Justice*, 208: 1-6.

Tiefenbrun, S.
2002 "Sex sells but drugs don't talk: trafficking of women sex workers and an economic solution", *Thomas Jefferson Law Review*, 24: 161-189.

United Nations (UN)
2005 *A Comprehensive Strategy to Eliminate Future Sexual Exploitation and Abuse in United Nations Peacekeeping Operations*, United Nations, New York.

United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF)/UNAIP
2003 *Project TRACE: Trafficking from Community to Exploitation*, Interim Report.

UN Office on Drugs and Crime
2002 *Results of a Pilot Survey on Forty Selected Organized Criminal Groups in Sixteen Countries*, UN, New York.

US Agency for International Development (USAID)
2002 *Trafficking in Persons: USAID's Response*, USAID, Washington, DC.

US Department of State
2002 *Trafficking in Persons Report*, US Department of State, Washington, DC.
2003 *Trafficking in Persons Report*, US Department of State, Washington, DC.
2004 *Trafficking in Persons Report*, US Department of State, Washington, DC.

Van der Kleij, A.
2002 *Provisions for Victims of Trafficking in Bonded Labour, i.e. Prostitution in Six Countries*, BlinN, Amsterdam.

Zimmerman, C., et al.
2003 *The Health Risks and Consequences of Trafficking in Women and Adolescents: Findings from a European Study*, London School of Tropical Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, London.